Examining Empowerment: Narratives of ‘Homemakers’ from Rural Pakistan

Rabia Ali PhD¹, Farhan Ahmad,² & Saira Batool³

Abstract

The main aim of this study was to examine women’s experiences of empowerment in District Karak in the Khyber Pakhtun Khwa Province of Pakistan. The data for this paper comes from in-depth interviews with women who were selected by using purposive sampling technique. Interview guide was prepared as a tool for collecting primary data and the data was thematically analyzed. Theoretically, this study is inspired by Connell’s theories of patriarchal dividend and hegemonic masculinity. It was found that the segregation of spaces, the norm of purdah (veil), mobility issues, male dependency, family control, harassment in public spaces, and inadequate rewards given to women in the private spheres were some of the social-cultural factors that limited women from exercising independent agency. The research findings highlight that it is not only patriarchy that disadvantages women but women’s self-internalization of the patriarchal system also contributes to women’s subordination. The study recommends that for women’s empowerment it is important to keep men on board.

Keywords: Women, Empowerment, Home Makers, Household, Decision Making

1. Introduction

Women in patriarchal societies including South Asia remain in subordinate position and are denied access to honored and utilitarian role enjoyed by men. The roles of administrators and property owners and positions of leadership in societal affairs including religion and governance exclusively belong to men (Hora, 2014). Cultural beliefs and practices are the major barriers to women’s empowerment in the society. Patriarchal control is exercised and justified on the basis of culture, traditions, customs, and religion. This largely defines the prescribed role of women in society and consequently affects their mobility and their access to economic assets, social and political power. Women are denied the right to make personal decisions like the right to get married (Jehan, 2000).

Women’s empowerment includes awareness of women about their rights to begin with and may also be extended to feelings of self-reliance, self-confidence, control, power to make decisions and in later stages women’s ability to bring positive changes in the society (Ali, 2013). There are many interrelated factors which are associated with empowerment including economic, social, political and personal factors (Eyben, Kabeer & Cornwall, 2008; Yogendrarajah, 2013). Economic empowerment is related to women’s contribution in the household income and to the economy in general. This can be through participation either in labour force or through access to income generating activities. Social empowerment connotes attempts taken to enhance women’s status in the society. It is related to gender justice and equality. Political empowerment is concerned about the participation of women in politics. It indicates the importance of women’s right to vote and to have access to provincial and national assemblies. Finally, personal empowerment is about ‘power within.’ It highlights the need for women to have personal autonomy and agency (Eyben et al., 2008).

¹ Assistant Professor Department of Sociology, International Islamic University Islamabad, Pakistan.
² PhD Scholar Department of Sociology International Islamic University Islamabad, Pakistan.
³ Lecturer/PhD Scholar Department of Sociology International Islamic University Islamabad, Pakistan.
In the context of Pakistan, the main hindrance to women’s empowerment is the belief that the role of women is limited within the private sphere where they are expected to look after children and home while men have to fulfill the financial needs by working in the labor market. The barrier to women’s empowerment is also lack of acceptance from men that women too have agency. The patriarchal nature of Pakistani society limits women’s mobility and their right to have personal lives. Often women are unaware of their rights and where they do know that wrong is being done to them, they feel it is useless to speak against men (Sohail, 2014).

Despite the fact that women constitute half the population in Pakistan, they are denied equal opportunities to participate in national development. Women in Pakistan are considered second class citizens and are often vulnerable to poverty, religious extremism and different types of violence (Khan, 2006). Women are expected to control their sexuality to ensure family honor. Violence against women is the most pervasive tool to control women’s sexuality and exercise of gender-power relations in the country (Tarar & Pulla, 2014).

This paper aims to explore the experiences of ordinary women who are confined within their homes in District Karak, in the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Province of Pakistan (KPK), Pakistan. The purpose is to highlight the significance of women’s unpaid work and so the term ‘homemaker’ will be used instead of housewife. The paper will attempt to investigate and highlight the socio-cultural factors which effect women’s empowerment by restricting women’s lives and denying them active agency. It will examine areas of power and ownership including; decision making, mobility, savings, purchasing power and ownership of property among others. It will also explore women’s participation in income generating activities and their perceptions of home.

2. Literature Review

This research is inspired by the “Patriarchal Dividend Theory” of Connell (1997). Patriarchy is a gendered system where males dominate women’s lives and masculinity is valued several times more as compared to femininity (Connell, 2007). Connell (1997) has used the term patriarchal dividend to refer to three types of advantages that male have over female in the society including economic political and employment opportunities. Such advantages give upper hand to males over females especially in patriarchal societies like Pakistan.

Connell (1997) uses the term hegemonic masculinity to refer to the patterns of practices that allow men’s dominance over women to continue. Connell builds on Gramsci (1971) who had used the concept of cultural hegemony to demonstrate how the ruling class maintains its dominance not through coercion but through willingness and spontaneous consent of the ruled. Similarly, Connell (1990) uses the concept of hegemonic masculinity to refer to a type of masculinity that subordinates men. She is of the view that it is considered as a standard against which everything else in the society is measured. It becomes hegemonic since it is widely accepted without resistance. This acceptance reinforces the dominant gender ideology in the society (Trujillo, 1991). Connell allows us to locate male dominance on both micro (family) as well as macro (public sphere) levels. It is because of hegemonic masculinity that women internalize patriarchy without questioning it.

In rural areas of Pakistan, men are the primary breadwinner. Clearly, women are economically and often socially dependent on men. The economic structure is monopolized by male where the property and inheritance rights are under the control of male (Naz & Ahmad, 2012). Women’s due rights in the society are denied largely because of illiteracy and lack of economic opportunities (Babur, 2007). Women find it hard to speak up against their rights. Family disputes are considered personal and are seldom reported since they are believed to belong to the private domain. Where women do take initiatives, they encounter structural problems and have to face serious consequences. News and reports related to honor killing, acid attacks; rape, bride burning and women harassment make headlines on regular basis in Pakistan (Saigol, 1995).

The concept of women’s autonomy and empowerment in the Pakistani society is considered negative among many especially in rural settings. Locally empowerment is perceived as unnecessary independence that is likely to disturb familial life and can set patterns for others. This is believed to be destructive for the society in general (Naz et al., 2012). It is believed that such liberation if given to women will dismantle the family environment. It is also perceived that traditional roles of women will suffer (Tarar & Pulla, 2014). Women’s participation in the household activities has always remained unpaid and unacknowledged (Roy & Tisdell, 2002). In denying acknowledgment for women’s work, it has been argued that taking care of familial needs is a labour of love. Nevertheless, what is ignored is the fact that the labour at home also involves sorrow and drudgery (Antonopoulos, 2008). In the context of India Acharya (1993) has pointed out that the society does not recognize women’s contribution in social life.
Findings from feminist writings from Muslim societies have revealed that one of the most powerful tools of patriarchy is control over women’s sexuality. At times religion too is used an instrument to legitimize control over women’s lives (Ilkkaracan, 2000).

Progress towards gender equality and women’s empowerment needs serious attention from all stakeholders. The vital point to consider is the fact that it is neither “normal” nor “natural” for women to perform the unpaid labour (Antonopoulos, 2008). Social acknowledgement of women’s contribution can play a significant role in changing their lives and improving their social status (Heaton et al, 2005). Women can gain agency and feel empowered through awareness of their rights and through access to resources, by deciding for themselves and by gaining access to opportunities (Kabeer, 2012). Importantly, the traditional beliefs considering women as inferior, or as personal property has to change (Babur, 2007).

3. Methodology

The study was carried out in a Southern District Karak in the Khyber Pakhtun Khwa Province of Pakistan (KPK), by using qualitative research design. The decision of qualitative research was made to get deeper insight into the respondents’ lives (Creswell, 2003). Since the aim of this research was not generalization but in-depth exploration, it was decided to choose limited number of ‘homemakers’ to focus on their lived experiences from emic perspective. Consequently, by employing purposive sampling technique (Patton, 2002) six women were selected. Measures were taken to select the cases which were unique in every respect to allow richness in the data collected. The data for this research was collected through face to face in-depth interviews using a structured interview guide. The interviews were conducted in Pashto by the second researcher who belongs to the region and has command over the language. The researcher was accompanied by a female relative since the norm of seclusion does not allow interaction of men with women. The interviews were taken in the respondents’ homes as per their convenience. During the interview, other female members of the family were also often present. Each interview lasted for 40 to 60 minutes. The interviews were then translated into Standard English. In addition to interviews, field observations were used to enrich the data. Informed consent of the women was taken prior to the interviews (Silverman, 2001). Codes were assigned to the data which enabled us to identify similarities and differences. The codes were read repeatedly several times and themes were derived. All possible measures have been taken to ensure confidentiality of the respondents (Patton, 2002).

4. Findings and Discussion

4.1. Women’s Work at Home

Research shows that women do maximum work at home and they get limited leisure time. In Pakistani society, women are exclusively responsible for performing household chores and responsibilities including cooking, cleaning, child care, caring for elders among others. In rural areas these chores are extended and may also include i.e collection of fuels’ wood for domestic use, making dung cake for domestic use, grazing cows and so on (Roy & Tisdell, 2002). In this study, the participants shared their experiences of heavy work load at home and the dilemma that their contribution remained unacknowledged and unappreciated. Almost all the respondents reported to wake up early in the morning and sleep late at night and to be engaged in heavy work during the day. They prioritize the needs of others and had little personal time. The respondents were of the view that in their society men took women’s work for granted and women did not get appreciation for their hard work and dedication.

In patriarchal societies, those women are considered respectful who meet the expected standards of womanhood. A woman’s mind, speech, and body are expected to be kept in subjugation. In Roman culture a wife is considered as a minor, ward, a person having no capability of acting according to her personal choice, she is considered as constantly instructed and guarded by her spouse (Zajko & Leonard, 2006). In the context of Pakistan, women are expected to be in subordinate role and be obedient to men. This was also evidenced through the findings of this study. The data illustrates that women were evaluated on the basis of their nurturing role as a good mother a good wife a good cook and a good nurse. On a question regarding expectations from family Fozia stated,

Making delicious food items are mostly appreciated by the male family members in the family and negligence in taking care of children is mostly deprecated (Fozia, interview)
This indicates that good women’s potentialities were intently made limited to household chores and they were only appreciated in such roles. Women did not have the liberty to take initiatives and to give their opinion regarding important household matters. As Zakia stated “arguing back with my husband mostly makes him aggressive. At times reasoning and arguments also lead to violence where he ends up beating me.”

Hence, women who argued with their husbands had to bear the consequences in the form of physical violence. The women strongly believed that women who openly resisted their husbands were not considered respectable in the society. Clearly, men used their physical strength to control women’s agency. Two out of the six informants reported to have encountered physical violence at the hands of their husbands. They reported the behavior of their husbands as rude, harsh, aggressive, and uncooperative. Nevertheless, despite these complain some believed that women’s duty is to work inside home and men’s responsibility is to earn and feed the family. This shows the internalization of patriarchy among women which is largely due to the hegemonic masculinity which is reinforced through a series of training given to women at home in the patriarchal system.

4.2. Participation in Economic Activities

Women’s participation in economic activities is considered as one of the major sources through which they can become empowered. Research has established that women who participate in economic activities can improve their status in the society. Roy and Niranjan (2004) in their study found that women involved in economic activities had greater level of autonomy compared to those women who did not have such opportunities.

Economic dependency of women was considered as one of the major causes for women’s powerlessness in the study area. The respondents were not directly involved in any income generating activity as such yet they did contribute to the family income in many ways. Women were engaged in agricultural activities outside home which they considered their responsibility. Yet they were unaware of their contribution to the family because of their participation in agricultural activities.

Additionally, the respondents disapproved those women who worked outside for monetary benefits. They were of the view that this is an area which is the responsibility of men and so women have no need to get indulged in such activities. They were firm that working women are disliked in the society since they remain outside home for long durations without male supervision. This again shows the prevalence of hegemonic masculinity and the internalization of patriarchy among the women. Yet those homemakers who were educated and were involved in some kind of income generating activities had different views. They realized their importance in the family and the fact that they were contributing in multiple ways. For example, Sumaira explained that she did tailoring and home tuitions which was one way to earn some money for personal use. Additionally, she acknowledged her day to day contribution to the family. Hence, educated home makers were aware of the importance of their unpaid economic participation. This indicates that education and income leads to empowerment.

4.3. Savings and Purchasing Power

The amount of saving affects purchasing power which is an indicator of empowerment as it involves the concept of choice (Hashemi & Schuler, 1993). In this study only those home makers who had access to cash through some sort of income generating activity reported to have saving. However, this too had very little worth. One of the respondents named Sumaira who was a tailor stated, “I spend all I earn on the daily expenditure of the family, there is no question of saving.” Clearly, women rarely had the chance to make personal purchases. They reported to make purchases of low monetary value and this too was related to household needs i.e. cups, glasses and plates for daily usage. These too were often purchased in the presence of male family members.

In case women took initiatives to make such purchases, alone they were discouraged. Fozia explained that, “mostly these purchased items are considered as unnecessary by the male family members.” Likewise, Hadiqa was of the view that usually it was her husband or other male family members who were responsible for purchasing. This indicates that, women were dependent on men for purchasing of personal items too. They had no purchasing power even for their personal cloths and garments, which hindered their social development. Nevertheless, none of the women had ever questioned this and they had no urge to purchase items personally. Some of the women believed that men are wise to deal with the shopkeepers and as women they would be deceived by the shopkeepers. Humaira stated, “I avoid making purchases because I fear that the shopkeeper may deceive me because I am a woman and have no knowledge of prices and material used for clothing” (Humaira, interview)
This excerpt illustrates that the women voluntarily restrained from participating in purchases. They had lack of confidence regarding purchasing items, due to their lack of confidence in themselves. This eventually leads to sense of worthlessness and disempowerment. Importantly, women considered themselves worthless and as a second class citizen as illustrated in the above excerpt.

4.4. Assets, Property Rights

Research has established that the possession of assets support women to become independent and to gain a sense of agency and empowerment (Roy & Tisdell, 2002). The female property holders tend to have better social positions in their families. However, often it happens that women abandon their property in favor of male siblings. Restrictions on women’s property right decrease their economic position and hence they remain subordinate to men (Tisdell 2002). In this study, it was reported by the majority of the women that the only asset they possessed was gold which was given to them at the time of marriage. However, the women did not have control over this asset too. None of the women reported to have inherited property either from the parent’s side or from husband’s side. One of the respondents shared her experience that she possessed 60-gram (06 Tula) gold. She said,

I have gold which I can use on special occasions like marriages, celebrations, but I am not allowed to sell it or even exchange it. It is kept with my mother in law and my husband has the authority over it. (Fozia, interview)

The excerpt clearly indicates that women had minimum control over personal assets and women’s asset and property was considered a family property and asset. They associated this control to cultural expectations and norms of the society. Possession of land, plots and houses by women was not very common. This form of property was owned by men alone and they had complete authority over it. Interestingly, women did not desire to have property in their name and believed that it was better off with a male figure. Surprisingly, women did not view possession of property positively as is evident from the following excerpt.

The society has a strong contempt from the women who hold economic possessions. The economic possession affects the role of women and is likely to create disturbance in the family and society. (Nelofer, interview)

This highlights that women intentionally did not desire to have hold over material property since it was perceived negatively in the society. Women prioritized societal perceptions of what is right and what is wrong notwithstanding how it affected their personal interests. The women reported that according to their understanding religion has no restriction on the economic possession of women and Islam has given women the right of property ownership. Nevertheless, they were also of the opinion that property should be the ownership of men. There was a cultural trend in the society that women were not given property right which was accepted by the women as normal. Hence, women were intently deprived of economic resources by the ruling class i.e. men so that their hegemonic masculinity could sustain for a longer time subordinating the subordinate class i.e. women.

4.5. Purdah (Veil) and Social Mobility

Mobility and purdah (veil) are two important factors to determine the empowerment of women. These have been used by scholars to measure empowerment in different contexts. Jejeebhoy (2002) used three main factors for measuring women’s empowerment in the context of India. These include choice of mobility, access to assets and participation in policies making. Research reports that purdah (veil) is a physical and socio-economic isolation of women in Islamic states (Ghuman, 2003). Women having choice of mobility and career opportunities are likely to have greater empowerment as compared to women observing purdah (veil) (Mason & Smith, 2003). In this study it was reported that purdah (veil) confines women to their home and segregates them from the outside world. The experiences of the women indicate that often the male members were the ones who compelled women to observe purdah (veil) and to have limited mobility. Additionally, some women did not have positive opinion about purdah (veil).

Fozia showed a strong contempt to veil as she said, “While wearing niqab (veil) I feel awkward but our society has imposed it on us”. Another respondent explained, “Purdah restricts our mobility in the society.” These views clarify that purdah (veil) was not a choice for these women. Yet the socio-cultural norms and values of the society compelled them to observe it.
Nevertheless, not all women held this view. Some of them considered purdah (veil) as a means of protection in public spaces. Hadiqa stated, “I veil in public spaces, to escape male staring.” This indicates that, the purdah (veil) is a safeguard a shield which protects women from harassment in public places thus encouraging their participation in education and employment. Though purdah (veil) was reported to be one factor to ensure free autonomy of women yet women still encountered issues related with mobility in the male dominated society. Women had restrictions related to mobility and this made them dependent on male. Such restrictions were deeply embedded in the cultural norms of the society.

4.6. Power, Authority and Decision Making

Previous research has illustrated that women who live with their in-laws are more likely to become subordinate to the authority of senior females in the family (Kabeer, 2001). In this study since the power structure of the society was strong women were not in a position to bargain power with their male counterparts. Since all the respondents lived in joint families and their mothers in law were alive so they had limited authority in the family and little say in decision making at household level. Sumaira explained that her father in law did not allow her to work in the labour market and she had to comply with his decision. This indicates that, women were in subordinate position and under suppression of male. Men had the authority to make decisions. Following excerpt clarifies this.

The male family members (Head of family) takes decisions after detailed discussions with other adult male family members as well as mother in law (Humaria, interview)

However, this shows the subordination of the young women but it also points that women are likely to get some level of power in their lives with age. Here too internalization of patriarchy was evident as is clear from the excerpt. “Wise woman make his husband a king and becomes a queen while a silly woman makes his husband her servant and becomes wife of servant” (Sumaira, interview). This shows women’s support for patriarchy instead of challenging and breaking it.

5. Conclusion

The paper evidenced that women in the study area worked long hours and their work remained unpaid, unappreciated, and unacknowledged. Women encountered restricted mobility and their chances of education, social contacts, and choice of selecting economic career were also limited. Even at the time of extreme necessity women were not allowed to travel in the public spaces alone. Women were also deprived of the right to own property. They were involved in the agricultural activities yet they were unaware of the importance of their contribution. Women had internalized patriarchy to the extent that they did not even question their basic rights as a woman. Male supremacy in the study area was clearly evident. Cultural norms and values acted as a shield under which hegemonic masculinity was reinforced. This resulted in low socio-economic status of the women. It denied women decision making power and active agency i.e. to be able to reflexively think about right and wrong, to be able to question and analyze. It is recommended that in order to empower women the power structure needs to be critically analyzed and transformed. Women need support economically, socially, emotionally and psychologically. They need to be given opportunities and freedom of expression. In this way their capabilities and potentials can be utilized in the mainstream national development. For doing this, efforts are needed to concentrate on men too. Unless men ready to let go of some of their power women will remain marginalized and voiceless.

References


